

# A Chronological Bibliography of ‘Allāma al-Ḥillī’s Works on Theology (Kalām)

Mohammad Moeinifar<sup>1</sup>

Received: 12 May 2023 / Accepted: 22 November 2023

## Abstract

‘Allāma al-Ḥillī was undoubtedly a brilliant scholar over the Shiite history, who was praised by both his friends and his enemies. At his time, most courtiers of the Mongol king were fanatic Sunnis, and the Mongols did not have adequate insight into Shiism. ‘Allāma al-Ḥillī wrote many books about Islamic jurisprudence, principles of jurisprudence, and in particular, Shiite theology or *kalām*, which left significant impacts on the prevalent atmosphere of the time. He wrote many books on theology, each of which can be studied on its own. In this article, I overview twenty-nine theological works by ‘Allāma al-Ḥillī given the dates of their writing. The chronological order is crucial here, because I believe that he wrote the works due to the requirements and demands of his time. His works took on the color of his time and context. This is important for the methodology of theology in our time, since by deploying his method and simulating the present context, we can produce efficient works of theology for today’s requirements.

**Keywords:** ‘Allāma al-Ḥillī, works, theology (*kalām*), Shia.

## Introduction

In Shiite books of *rijāl* (evaluation of hadith transmitters), the entries on ‘Allāma al-Ḥillī often take up many pages. Almost all scholars of *rijāl* list his works. Moreover, Allāma al-Ḥillī himself lists his works and writings in his *Khulāṣat al-aqwāl*. There are two crucial points here, which motivated me to write this article. First, unfortunately, some of ‘Allāma al-Ḥillī’s theological works are lost and unavailable to us to day. This raises the question: How might the works of a scholar as prominent as al-Ḥillī be lost? In this article, I suggest a reason why his works are lost. Second, almost all those who wrote about ‘Allāma al-Ḥillī list his works on theology (or *kalām*), but they do not provide us with a chronology of their writings. Given the significance of a chronological order of those works, I could identify the dates of the writing of most of ‘Allāma al-Ḥillī’s works. It turned out that he wrote some

1. Associate Professor, Department of Theological Denominations, University of Religions and Denominations, Qom, 13357, Iran. Email: [moeinifar92@yahoo.com](mailto:moeinifar92@yahoo.com)

of those works during his journeys to Iran along with the Mongol king; some were polemical given the environment of the Mongol court; and some were expository because he wrote them at the request of his friends.

It goes without saying that since the manuscripts of some of the works were not available, I could not identify the exact dates of their writing, but given the extant evidence, I made speculations about their dates.

## 1. 'Allāma al-Ḥillī's Biography

The diligent Shiite scholar Abū Maṣṣūr Ḥasan b. Yūsuf b. 'Alī b. Muṭahhar al-Asadī, known as 'Allāma al-Ḥillī and titled as Jamāl al-Dīn, Āyatullāh, and 'Allāmat al-Dahr, was born on Ramadan 29, 648 AH (December 15, 1250 CE) and died on Muharram 21, 726 AH (December 18, 1325 CE). His mausoleum is located on an outside hall of the Shrine of Imam Amīr al-Mu'minīn in Najaf, Iraq. He wrote many works on Islamic jurisprudence (*fiqh*), principles of jurisprudence (*uṣūl al-fiqh*), *ri-jāl* (evaluation of hadith transmitters), theology or *kalām*, Quranic exegesis, ethics, hadith, mysticism, Arabic morphology, Arabic syntax, and logic. His jurisprudential and theological works overshadow the rest of his works, because he was an innovative jurist and a skillful theologian.

He was somewhat engaged in politics too. For in 707 AH (1307 CE), the Mongol king Öljaitü<sup>2</sup> converted to Shiism under the influence of 'Allāma al-Ḥillī (Mūsawī Khwānsārī 1990, 2), giving himself the title "Khodabande" (servant of God).<sup>3</sup> In 709 AH (1309 CE), al-Ḥillī is invited by the king to accompany him in a journey to Iran. For a while, he stayed with the king in Soltaniyeh in Qazvin, where he met with the scholars of different denominations (Davani 1985, 4:245). Khodabande asked 'Allāma al-Ḥillī to accompany him both at home and during journeys. Because of 'Allāma al-Ḥillī's companionship with the Mongol king, the credit for Öljaitü's conversion to Shiism can be surely given to al-Ḥillī (Eqbal Ashtiani 1986, 316; Kāshānī 2005, 101; Mūsawī Khwānsārī 1990, vol. 2; Afandī 1980, vol. 1).

### 1.1. The Historical Approach to Kalām before 'Allāma al-Ḥillī (The School of Baghdad)<sup>4</sup>

A theological school before 'Allāma al-Ḥillī is the School of Baghdad, the cornerstone of which was laid down by al-Shaykh al-Mufīd (d. 413 AH/1022 CE),

2. This is a Mongolian word, meaning "blessed."

3. Some prejudiced Sunni scholars could not tolerate this. For instance, Ibn al-Hajar al-'Asqalānī mockingly refers to the king as "Kharbande," which literally means "servant of the donkey" (Qāḍī Nūrullāh al-Shūshtarī or Tustarī 1997, 1:72). Some, however, believe that "Khodabande" was a distortion in transcriptions, and the original word was "Kharbuta" which in the Mongolian language meant "the blessed great king" (Amīn 1982, 5:399).

4. It should be noted that this section and the next are derived from a lecture by Mohammad Taghi Sobhani, which was delivered for research on Imami articles of faith. I have edited and provided citations for the material.

the prominent Shiite theologian and jurist. The works written before al-Shaykh al-Mufīd tended to be written with a monographic, apologetic, and polemic approach. With works such as *al-Nukat fī muqaddamāt al-uṣūl* (The points on preliminaries of the principles),<sup>5</sup> *al-Nukat al-i'tiqādiyya* (The points concerning beliefs),<sup>6</sup> *Awā'il al-maḡālāt fī al-madhāhib wa-l-mukhtārāt* (The primary essays on denominations and espoused doctrines),<sup>7</sup> and *Taṣḥīḥ i'tiqādāt al-Imāmiyya* (Correction of Imami beliefs),<sup>8</sup> Mufīd can be viewed as the first scholar who wrote a comprehensive article of faith with a rational approach.

This approach to theology, which relies on reason and is comprehensive, continued in the hands of Mufīd's students, particularly al-Sayyid al-Murtaḍā (d. 436 AH/ 1044 CE). Al-Sayyid al-Murtaḍā wrote two books with this approach: *al-Mulakhkhaṣ fī usūl al-dīn* (The summary on the principles of religion) and *al-Dhakhīra fī 'ilm al-kalām* (The provision on the science of theology), yielding a comprehensive course of argumentative theology ('Alam al-Hudā 1990). If we take these two books as a single book, as al-Sayyid al-Murtaḍā recommended his readers to study them as one ('Alam al-Hudā 1990, 607), he might be considered the first scholar who wrote a comprehensive argumentative book on Islamic theology or *kalām*. He wrote another book under *Jumal al-'ilm wa-l-'amal* concerning the main five beliefs, followed by discussions of jurisprudential issues ('Alam al-Hudā 1967).

Another remarkable fact about this period is the production of doctrinal essays in the form of questions and answers. This style of writing began since the period of al-Shaykh al-Mufīd.

After al-Sayyid al-Murtaḍā comes the last prominent figure in the School of Baghdad: Shaykh al-Ṭā'ifā al-Ṭūsī (d. 460 AH/ 1067 CE). Along with al-Sayyid al-Murtaḍā, al-Shaykh al-Ṭūsī attended the lectures of al-Shaykh al-Mufīd during the last five years of his life (Amīn 1982, 9:159). After that, he attended the lectures of al-Sayyid al-Murtaḍā, the greatest among al-Mufīd's students, from 413 AH (1022 CE) to 436 AH (1044 CE), when al-Sayyid al-Murtaḍā passed away. His companionship with two major theologians and jurists turned al-Shaykh al-Ṭūsī into an exemplary scholar.

5. Chapters in this work grapple with issues such as the meanings of words in preliminaries of speculation, nature of accidents (*a'rād*), incipience (*hudūth*) of the world, repudiation of anthropomorphism about God (*tashbīh*), monotheism, imamate, promise, and threat. See Mufīd 1992b.

6. The chapters in this work address issues such as knowledge of God, positive and negative divine attributes, divine justice, prophethood, imamate, and resurrection. See Mufīd 1992a.

7. The first issue addressed by al-Shaykh al-Mufīd in this work is the distinction between Mu'tazilite and Shiite theologies. He compares Mu'tazilite theological views with those of the Shia. This is followed by a discussion of 156 theological problems. See Mufīd 1992c.

8. It should be noted that this work is a critique of al-Shaykh al-Ṣadūq's book, *al-I'tiqādāt* (The beliefs). It is not like standard theological books, which discuss the five main issues of monotheism, divine justice, prophethood, imamate, and resurrection. It gives an overview of some beliefs, and then discusses the meaning of power (*istiḡā'a*), the meaning of the Throne, the Tablet and the Pen, the limit of excommunication, exaggeration about Shiite Imams, dissimulation (*taqīyya*), and the like. See Mufīd 1992d.

Although al-Shaykh al-Ṭūsī was an expert in Islamic theology, he was not as innovative as his two teachers. On the whole, he wrote an elaborate commentary on al-Sayyid al-Murtaḍā's *Jumal al-ilm wa-l-amal* under *Tamhīd al-uṣūl* (Preparation of the principles) and a lengthy book under *al-Iqtisād fīmā yata'allaq bi-l-i'tiqād* (The moderation on what belongs to the belief). In the latter book, he begins with an overview of the beliefs and then discusses some jurisprudential issues.<sup>9</sup> Another theological book by al-Shaykh al-Ṭūsī is *al-Aqā'id al-Ja'fariyya*, a short book summarizing theological issues in terms of fifty problems (Shaykh al-Ṭūsī 1990).

A characteristic of this period, particularly the School of Baghdad, is the exclusive authority of reason. That is, reason is the only reliable source in understanding theological issues. Prior to al-Shaykh al-Mufīd, particularly in the schools of Kufa and Qom, although theologians did not reject reason, they adopted a textualist approach. The Mu'tazilite approach to theological issues was rationalism in the sense of assigning exclusive authority to reason. Before the Imami School of Baghdad, both reason and revelation were deemed authoritative. For this reason, there were people like al-Shaykh al-Ṣadūq who maintained that if someone is born and grows in a desert alone, he or she will definitely learn that this world has a creator, but anything beyond that requires an authority other than reason, and indeed, reason is just a child in this domain (Ṣadūq 1977, 290). With people such as al-Shaykh al-Mufīd, al-Sayyid al-Murtaḍā, and al-Shaykh al-Ṭūsī, this approach became standard among Shiite theologians.

## 1.2. The Historical Approach to Theology in 'Allāma al-Ḥillī's Period (School of Hillah)

With the establishment of new governments and al-Shaykh al-Ṭūsī's move from Baghdad to Najaf, the School of Baghdad ceased to thrive, and in fact, the Shiite theology went through a theological isolation. Of course, the School of Rey was active at the time, although it produced no notable works except for a few commentaries on the main theological works. The main work belonging to the School of Rey is the book *al-Munqidh min al-taqlīd wa-l-murshid ilā al-tawḥīd* (The savor from imitation and the guide to monotheism) or *al-Ta'liq al-'Irāqī* (The Iraqī commentary) by Saḍīd al-Dīn Ḥimmaṣī (d. 673 AH/ 1274 CE). Although the book was written in Hillah (Ḥimmaṣī 1991, 1:18), it owes to the School of Rey.

On the whole, Saḍīd al-Dīn Ḥimmaṣī's move to Iraq and then Hillah in 550 AH (1155 CE) marks the beginning of the School of Hillah. This school has two eras: early and later. The later School of Hillah is the period before Khwāja Naṣīr al-Dīn

9. The book's title is recorded as *al-Iqtisād al-hādī ilā ṭarīq al-rashād* (The moderation guiding to the path of rectitude) as well. Some people believe that these are distinct books, but my survey shows that they are distinct titles for the same book. The question remains when and how the different titles emerged.

al-Ṭūsī. Al-Muḥaqqiq al-Ḥillī’s (d. 676 AH/ 1277 CE) *al-Maslak fī uṣūl al-dīn* (The route in the principles of religion)<sup>10</sup> belongs to this period. The later period begins with Khwāja Naṣīr, who created a philosophical atmosphere with his philosophy lectures, and in practice, imported philosophy and injected a methodological approach into Shiite theology. With him, a philosophical approach prevailed theology. Of course, Shiite theologians did not follow the rules advocated by Muslim philosophers. For instance, philosophers adhered to the rule of “impossibility of preponderance without a preponderator” (*tarjīḥ bi-lā murtajjih*), which theologians rejected, since in the case of human free will, they do not take the human action to be an effect of the causal system, but a preponderator of one action over another.

In his *Tajrīd al-i’tiqād*, Khwāja Naṣīr al-Dīn al-Ṭūsī left an impact on subsequent theologians and philosophers, but some of his philosophical views were rejected by theologians. ‘Allāma al-Ḥillī who had studied the theology section of Avicenna’s *Book of Healing* with Khwāja Naṣīr rejected his teacher’s belief in the immateriality of the soul (Ḥillī 1992b, 181). An paradigm example of this theological method or style can be found in ‘Allāma al-Ḥillī’s *Bāb ḥādī ‘ashr*. The most prominent figure in this school is ‘Allāma al-Ḥillī, who left an indelible heritage by writing over thirty theological works.

Another prominent figure in this theological school was Ḥillī’s son, Fakhr al-Muḥaqqiqīn, who wrote many commentaries on his father’s works, although he did not make novel contributions to the field. A third figure in this period is al-Shahīd al-Awwal whose theological works include *al-Ustunbūliyya*, *al-Maqālat al-taklīfiyya*, and *al-Arba ‘iniyya*.

Al-Fāḍil al-Miqdād (d. 826 AH/ 1422 CE) is the last prominent figure in the theological school of Hillah. He assiduously worked to refine theological views, which culminated in his book, *al-Lawāmi ‘al-ilāhiyya fī l-mabāḥith al-kalāmiyya*.<sup>11</sup> He also wrote commentaries on some of ‘Allāma al-Ḥillī’s theological works.

This period of Shiite theology is marked with its philosophical language, which was imported by Khwāja Naṣīr al-Dīn. Although the period begins with Sadīd al-Dīn al-Ḥimmaṣī and his book *al-Munqidh min al-taqīd wa-l-murshid ilā al-tawhīd*, and al-Muḥaqqiq al-Ḥillī wrote *al-Maslak fī uṣūl al-dīn*, which fortified the rational theology of the preceding period, it was Khwāja Naṣīr al-Dīn and ‘Allāma al-Ḥillī who transformed the context and imported the Islamic Peripatetic philosophy into Shiite theology. However, given that theology in this period was imbued with the philosophical language, the spirit of this theology still had the tone of the School of Baghdad, and hence, Shiite theology resisted against philosophical doctrines.

10. The main issue discussed in this book is monotheism, followed by God’s acts, prophethood, imamate. His *al-Risālat al-māti ‘iyya* is written with the same style.

11. This work is structured into twelve sections (called “lāmi”). This book begins with a discussion of the necessity of reflection and speculation. See Fāḍil al-Miqdād 2001.

### 1.3. 'Allāma al-Ḥillī's Theological Works

It goes without saying that 'Allāma al-Ḥillī was a well-known figure in Shiite theology, as attested by his various works on theology. The first book he wrote about theology was *Manāhij al-yaqīn fī uṣūl al-dīn* (Ways of certainty regarding the principles of religion), which he wrote at the age of thirty-two on Rabi' al-Awwal 6, 680 AH/ June 25, 1281 CE (Schmidtke 1999, 54). The most comprehensive among his theological works, however, is *Nahāyat al-marām fī 'ilm al-kalām* (The ultimate end regarding the science of theology). Al-Ḥillī's theological works are written at three levels: (1) brief works that are just concerned with outlines of theology, including *al-Abhāth al-mufīda fī taḥṣīl al-'aqīda* (Useful discussions on acquisition of the belief) (Āqā Buzurg Ṭīhrānī 1983, 1:63) and *Nahj al-mustarshidīn fī uṣūl al-dīn* (The way of the rectified on the principles of religion) (Ḥillī, n.d.); (2) intermediate works, which sometimes touch upon arguments as well, such as *Istiqṣā' al-naẓar fī l-qadā' wa-l-qadar* (Survey of the opinion on divine destiny and decree) (Ḥillī 1997) and *Muntahā al-wuṣūl* (The ultimate achievement); and (3) extended or elaborate works, which cite the views of opponents and proponents and bring arguments for al-Ḥillī's espoused views, such as *Nahāyat al-marām fī 'ilm al-kalām* (Ḥillī, n.d., 85; Fāḍil al-Miqdād 1984, 438). On the whole, a chronological order of 'Allāma al-Ḥillī's theological works is as follows:

1. *Manāhij al-yaqīn fī uṣūl al-dīn*, which I noted above. The book was transcribed twice during the author's lifetime: once in Muharram 722 AH (January 1322 CE) and once again in Sha'ban 724 AH (July 1324 CE), which indicates the significance of the work.
2. The brief essay titled *Nuẓum al-barāhīn fī uṣūl al-dīn*.
3. *Ma'ārij al-fahm fī sharḥ al-nuẓum* (Ardalan Javan 1986, 1:225). This commentary on *Nuẓum al-barāhīn* was written on Ramadan 6, 678 AH (January 10, 1280 CE). 'Allāma al-Ḥillī probably began the writing of *Nuẓum* and its commentary after *Manāhij*, although it was finished before *Manāhij* (Ḥillī 2009).
4. *Anwār al-malakūt fī sharḥ al-yāqūt*. This is an extended commentary on *al-Yāqūt* by Abū Ishāq Ibrāhīm b. Nawbakhtī, which Ḥillī finished writing in Jumada al-Thani 684 AH (August 1285). This is among the theological works by Ḥillī, which begin with a discussion about the necessity of reflection (Ḥillī 1984). In this work, 'Allāma al-Ḥillī cites his own *Manāhij al-yaqīn* (Ḥillī 1984, 3, 149, 193, 203) and *Ma'ārij al-fahm* (Ḥillī 1984, 13).<sup>12</sup>
5. *Muntahā al-wuṣūl fī 'ilmay al-kalām wa-l-uṣūl*. As the title suggests, the first part of the book is concerned with theology (which was finished on Jumada

12. There is of course a controversy over whether the book was actually written by Ibrāhīm b. Nawbakht. See *Riyāḍ al-'ulamā'* and *Tāsīs al-Shī'a*. Moreover, in the editor's preface to *Anwār al-malakūt*, there is a comprehensive study of the Nawbakht household and the attribution of the work to Ibrāhīm b. Nawbakht.

- al-Awwal 16, 687 AH/ June 18, 1288 CE), and the second is devoted to the principles of jurisprudence.
6. *Kashf al-murād fī sharḥ tajrīd al-i'tiqād*. This is an exposition of *Tajrīd al-i'tiqād* by Khwāja Naṣīr al-Dīn al-Ṭūsī (598-672 AH/ 1201-1274 CE), which received a much wider readership than the rest of his theological works, because it was the first extended commentary on *Tajrīd al-i'tiqād*. He finished writing the book on Rabi' al-Awwal 16, 696 AH (January 12, 1297). *Tajrīd al-i'tiqād* includes six parts: general problems (theology proper), substances and accidents (natural science), proofs for the creator and its attributes and effects, prophethood, imamate, and resurrection.
  7. *Nahāyat al-marām fī 'ilm al-kalām*. This is indeed the most important theological work by 'Allāma al-Ḥillī (Ḥillī, n.d., 38, 85; Fāḍil al-Miqdād 1984, 438), which was unfortunately left unfinished. Fāḍil al-Miqdād, who wrote commentaries on some of Ḥillī's works, admits that certain parts of the book were not available to him (Fāḍil al-Miqdād 1984, 395). Moreover, Muḥannā b. Sinān received a permission for transmission of hadiths from 'Allāma al-Ḥillī in 720 AH (1320 CE), which implies that until that time 'Allāma al-Ḥillī had finished four volumes of *Nahāyat al-marām* (Majlisī 1983, 107:148). Put together, these pieces of evidence leave no doubt that Ḥillī began writing *Nahāyat al-marām* after *Kashf al-murād*, because the early parts of the latter never cite *Nahāyat al-marām*, while citations to the book are made from the middle part (Ḥillī 2003, 120, 148, 172, 177), although he finished writing *Kashf al-murād* in 696 AH (1296 CE). Moreover, *Nahāyat al-marām* is cited in his *Nahj al-mustarshidīn*, which he had finished writing in 699 AH (1299 CE). This implies that Ḥillī began writing *Nahāyat al-marām* before 696 AH (1296 CE) and continued writing it until 720 AH (1320 CE), but it is not known what extent of the work was covered by the four volumes, which were finished until then. 'Allāma al-Ḥillī finished writing the first volume of the work on Rabi' al-Awwal 14, 712 AH (July 20, 1312 CE) and the second volume in Rabi' al-Thani 712 AH (August 1312 CE), while the third volume covers up to the seventh problem, but the rest is not available (Ḥillī 1998, 1:3). All things considered, this might be accounted for in two ways: he could not finish the book, or he finished the book, although it went missing.
  8. *Nahj al-mustarshidīn fī uṣūl al-dīn*. According to the transcriber of its manuscript, the author had finished writing the work on Rabi' al-Awwal 22, 699 AH (December 17, 1299), and the transcriber finished his work at Tuesday noon on Safar 23, 722 AH (March 13, 1322 CE); that is, during 'Allāma al-Ḥillī's lifetime. This is a brief work written at the request of Ḥillī's son, Fakhr al-Muḥaqqiqīn (Ḥillī, n.d., 17; Āqā Buzurg Ṭīhrānī 1983, 24:424).

9. *Kashf al-fawā'id fī sharḥ qawā'id al-'aqā'id*. This is an extended commentary on Khwāja Naṣīr al-Dīn's *Qawā'id al-'aqā'id*, which 'Allāma al-Ḥillī wrote at the request of Muḥammad Fakhr al-Muḥaqqiqīn on Dhu l-Hajjah 3, 703 AH (July 7, 1304 CE). The manuscript of the work was transcribed in 722 AH (1322 CE) in Ḥillī's lifetime (Āqā Buzurg Ṭīhrānī 1983, 18:51).
10. *Taslik al-nafs ilā ḥazīrat al-quds*. 'Allāma al-Ḥillī finished writing this work on Muharram 12, 704 AH (August 15, 1304 CE). Ḥillī's nephew (his sister's son), 'Amīd al-Dīn b. al-'A'raj al-Ḥillī, wrote an extended commentary on this work under *Idāḥ al-lubs fī sharḥ taslik al-nafs*, which is said to be written in 683 AH (1284 CE). This requires further research into *Taslik al-nafs*'s date of writing. For if the date of 'Amīd al-Dīn's commentary is correct, then *Taslik al-nafs* must have been written before that (Āqā Buzurg Ṭīhrānī 1983, 2:498; Schmidtke 1999, 59; also see Jafar Sobhani's preface to Ḥillī 2005, 13-14). *Taslik al-nafs* was written in reply to a question asked by Fakhr al-Muḥaqqiqīn. The book is structured into nine sections. It is similar to Khwāja Naṣīr al-Dīn's *Tajrīd al-i'tiqād*, although its prose is much simpler (Ḥillī 2005).
11. *Minhāj al-kirāma fī ma'rifat al-imāma*. This is a defense of the Shiite view of imamate. This is among the books Ḥillī dedicated to Mohammad Khodabande in Jumada al-Awwal 709 AH (October 1309 CE). The book is grounded in the well-known hadith: "He who dies while not knowing the imam of his time dies a death of ignorance." Ibn Taymiyya (d. 728 AH/1328 CE), who was contemporary with 'Allāma al-Ḥillī, wrote a refutation against the book under *Minhāj al-sunnat al-nabawiyya fī naqd kalām al-Shī'a wa-l-qadariyya* (The method of the prophetic tradition on refutation of the Shiite and Qadari view). Ali Hosseini Milani wrote an extended commentary on *Minhāj al-kirāma*, taking into consideration Ibn Taymiyyā's objections (Milani 1997).
12. *Risālat al-Sa'diyya*. 'Allāma al-Ḥillī dedicated this book to, and named it after, Sa'd al-Dīn Muḥammad al-Sāwujī al-Shahīd (d. 711 AH/ 1311 CE), a vizier of Khodabande (Āqā Buzurg Ṭīhrānī 1983, 12:183). The book is structured into three parts: beliefs, jurisprudential rulings, and ethics. A unique feature of the book is that, given his novel contributions and his mastery of different Islamic denominations, 'Allāma al-Ḥillī produced a work on comparative theology and comparative jurisprudence, which adopts a new approach. That is, it first provides a comparative study of theological problems and then a comparative study of jurisprudential problems. Given the date of Sa'd al-Dīn's death, the book must have been written before 711 AH (1311 CE).
13. *Istiḡṣā' al-naẓar fī l-baḥth 'an al-qaḍā' wa-l-qadar*. Khodabande asked 'Allāma al-Ḥillī about the reasons for human free will. In reply, 'Allāma



al-Ḥillī overviews the theories of Ash'arite and Mu'tazilite theologians, and then drawing on the religious texts, he formulates the arguments by Imamiyya. Ultimately, he presents Quranic verses to establish human free will as against determinism (Ḥillī 1997). Some Sunni scholars in India wrote refutations against this book. Qāḍī Sayyid Nūrullāh Shūshtarī al-Shahīd (d. 1019 AH/ 1610 CE) wrote an extended commentary on the book under *al-Nūr al-anwar wa-l-nūr al-azhar fī tanwīr khafāyā risālat al-qaḍā' wa-l-qadar* in response to their objections. The book was written in Shawwal 712 AH (February 1313 CE).

14. *Al-Alfayn al-fāriq bayn al-ṣidq wa-l-mayn*. 'Allāma al-Ḥillī wrote this book at the request of his son Fakhr al-Muḥaqqiqīn. As the title suggests, the book presents one thousand rational and textual arguments for Imam 'Alī's imamate and one thousand arguments against the opponents of his imamate. Hence the title *alfayn* (two thousand). He finished writing the book on Ramadan 1, 712 AH/ December 31, 1312 CE (Ḥillī 1988).
15. *Nahj al-ḥaqq wa-kashf al-ṣidq*. This book is structured into three parts: (1) beliefs, including perception, reflection, divine attributes, prophethood, imamate, and resurrection; (2) principles of jurisprudence; and (3) some jurisprudential problems. Faḍl b. Rūzbahān al-Iṣfahānī al-Shāfi'ī wrote a refutation against the book in 909 AH/1504 CE under *Ibtāl al-bāṭil wa-ihmāl kashf al-āṭil* (Shūshtarī 1997, 1:74). After that, Qāḍī Shahīd Sayyid Nūrullāh Tustarī or Shūshtarī (d. 1019 AH/ 1610 CE) wrote a reply to this under *Iḥqāq al-ḥaqq wa-izhāq al-bāṭil*.<sup>13</sup> *Nahj al-ḥaqq* is also directed at Ash'arite views. The book must have been written before 716 AH (1316 CE) because it was written after a debate between 'Allāma al-Ḥillī and some of his opponents<sup>14</sup> and was then written at the request of Khodabande, who died in 716 AH (1316 CE).
16. *Jawāb al-su'āl 'an ḥikmat al-naskh fī l-aḥkām al-ilāhiyya*. The king Mohammad Khodabande asked 'Allāma al-Ḥillī about the rationale behind abrogation of religious rulings, in reply to which Hillī wrote this book (Afandī 1980, 1:378). There are doubts about the content and date of this work, however.<sup>15</sup>
17. *Wājib al-i'tiqād 'alā jamī' al-'ibād*. This is a very brief essay, consisting of two sections: beliefs and jurisprudence. The first part discusses divine attributes, monotheism, divine justice, prophethood, and imamate, but it

13. Muḥammad Ḥasan al-Muzaffār also wrote the book *Dalā'il al-ṣidq* in response to Faḍl b. Rūzbahān's *Ibtāl al-bāṭil*, which has allusions to Ibn Taymiyya's view as well (Muzaffār 1995).

14. See Shūshtarī 1997, 1:14. He points to the debate at the opening of this book and mentions the arguments presented by 'Allāma al-Ḥillī against his opponents. Also see Mūsawī Khwānsārī 1990, vol. 2, no. 189.

15. Sabine Schmidtke (1999, 60) says that the book is about visiting the mausoleums of men of God.

does not deal with resurrection. The second discusses jurisprudential issues such as cleanliness, prayer, zakat, fasting, khums, hajj, 'umra, and jihad. Fāḍil al-Miqdād wrote an extended commentary on the book under *al-wājib al-i'tiqād* (Fāḍil al-Miqdād 1991). Unfortunately, I could not find a date for the book.

18. *Mu'taqad al-wāṣilīn* or *Maqdad al-wāṣilīn*. This book is not available to us.
19. *Al-Tanāsub bayn al-fīraq al-Ash'ariyya wa-l-Sūfastā'iyya* (The similarity between Ash'arite and Sophist groups). This book is also lost.
20. *Arba'īn mas'ala fī uṣūl al-dīn* (Forty books on the principles of religion). This book is also lost.
21. *Manāhij al-hidāya*. This book is lost.
22. *Ma'ārij al-dirāya*. This is also lost.
23. *Risāla fī buṭlān al-jabr*. This essay is attributed to 'Allāma al-Ḥillī, but it seems to be lost.
24. *Risāla fī taḥqīq ma'nā al-īmān*. This essay is also attributed to 'Allāma al-Ḥillī, but it is lost (Mūsawī Khwānsārī 1990, 2:275).
25. *Risāla fī khalq al-a'māl*. This is also attributed to 'Allāma al-Ḥillī, but it is lost.
26. *Al-Khulāṣa fī uṣūl al-dīn*. This essay is attributed to 'Allāma al-Ḥillī (Āqā Buzurg Ṭīhrānī 1983, 22:89).
27. *Al-Muqaddama fī l-kalām*. This essay is attributed to 'Allāma al-Ḥillī (Āqā Buzurg Ṭīhrānī 1983, 7:208).
28. *Ajwibat al-mas'āl al-Muhannā'iyya*. This is a manuscript about beliefs and jurisprudent, written in reply to a student of Ḥillī called Muhannā' b. Sinān. The jurisprudential part outweighs the theological part, which is why it is sometimes listed as a jurisprudential work by 'Allāma al-Ḥillī. He finished writing the book in Muharram 720 AH (February 1320 CE).
29. *Al-Bāb al-ḥādī 'āshr fīmā yajib 'alā 'āmmat al-mukallaḥīn min ma'rifa uṣūl al-dīn*. This is a short essay written originally as the eleventh par of *Minhāj al-ṣalāḥ fī mukhtaṣar al-miṣbāḥ*. 'Allāma al-Ḥillī wrote the essay on Dhu al-Hajjah 11, 723 AH (December 11, 1323 CE). This seems to be one of the last works written by Ḥillī. Since the essay is brief and intended for ordinary readers, it was translated into English and Persian. Many commentaries are written for the book. Indeed, *al-Dharī'a* mentions about thirty commentaries, annotations, and translations for the book (Āqā Buzurg Ṭīhrānī 1983, 3:5). Here are some of the commentaries:
  - a. *Al-Nāfi' yawm al-ḥashr* by al-Fāḍil al-Miqdād al-Suyūrī.
  - b. *Miftāh al-bāb* by Abū l-Faṭḥ b. Makhdūm al-Ḥusaynī (edited by Mahdi Mohaghegh).
  - c. *Irshād al-bashar fī sharḥ bāb al-ḥādī 'ashar* by Sulaymān b. Aḥmad al-Qaṭīfī.

- d. Sharḥ bāb ḥādī 'ashar by Mīrzā Ibrāhīm b. Kāshif al-Dīn Muḥammad b. Yazdī.
- e. Maṭāli' al-nazar by Ṣafī al-Dīn b. Fakhr al-Dīn al-Ṭurayhī.
- f. Mu'īn al-fikr fī sharḥ bāb ḥādī 'ashar by Ibn Abī Jumhūr al-Iḥsā'ī (Āqā Buzurg Ṭīhrānī 1983, 3:5).

Out of these works, eight are missing, with no manuscripts available to us today: *Mu'taqad al-wāsilīn* or *Maqḍad al-wāsilīn*; *al-Tanāsub bayn al-firaq al-Ash'ariyya wa-l-Sūfiyya*; *Arba'īn mas'ala fī uṣūl al-dīn*; *Manāhij al-hidāya*; *Ma'ārij al-dirāya*; *Risāla fī buṭlān al-jabr*; *Risāla fī taḥqīq ma'nā al-īmān*; and *Risāla fī khalq al-a'māl*. It should be noted that no exact date can be identified for lost works. The only thing we can tell is that they could not have been written before or after a certain date, because we know the dates of 'Allāma al-Ḥillī's first and last works, and in between, there are works whose dates are unknown.

It is crucial to acknowledge that it is considerably challenging to pinpoint precise dates for lost works. What we can establish is their temporal bounds within the broader context of 'Allāma al-Ḥillī's scholarly career. While we have concrete dates for some of his earliest and latest known works, the absence of specific dates for the lost works leaves a significant gap. We can infer that these missing writings fall within the timeline delineated by the known dates, as they could not have been authored prior to the earliest known work nor after the latest. Essentially, the known chronological framework offers us a parameter within which these lost works must have been produced, yet the precise timing remains elusive.

One plausible reason behind the loss of these books could be traced to a shift in patronage and attitudes toward 'Allāma al-Ḥillī's legacy. During the reign of Mohammad Khodabande, who held 'Allāma al-Ḥillī in high esteem and revered him as the epitome of virtue, the patronage for his works flourished. However, following Khodabande's reign, his son Abū Sa'īd, influenced by non-Shia advisors and courtiers, may not have shared the same reverence for the scholar. Consequently, governmental support for the transcription and preservation of 'Allāma al-Ḥillī's works dwindled. This decline in official backing likely contributed to the loss of some of his writings, even those penned during Khodabande's era. While this political shift may offer one explanation, further investigation could uncover additional factors contributing to the disappearance of these invaluable texts.

## Conclusion

Since theology is concerned with the confessional part of a denomination, the method adopted in theological studies is of utmost importance. There is no doubt that a method arises in proportion to temporal and spatial circumstances. A crucial historical time was that of 'Allāma al-Ḥillī when Islam encountered an enemy as ardent as the Mongols. Moreover, the courtiers and governmental officials were

prejudiced and narrow-minded. To know the exact dates when ‘Allāma al-Ḥillī wrote his theological works, we can identify the events in response to which he wrote. In this way, we can deploy his novel methods and find solutions for many contemporary problems.

## References

- Afandī, Mīrzā ‘Abdullāh. 1980. *Riyāḍ al-‘ulamā’ wa-ḥiyāḍ al-fuḍalā’*. Edited by al-Sayyid Aḥmad al-Ḥusaynī and al-Sayyid Maḥmūd al-Mar‘ashī. Qom: Matba‘a Khayyām.
- ‘Alam al-Hudā, al-Sayyid al-Murtaḍā. 1967. *Jumal al-‘ilm wa-l-‘amal*. Najaf: Matba‘a al-Adab.
- ‘Alam al-Hudā, al-Sayyid al-Murtaḍā. 1990. *Al-Dhakhīra fī ‘ilm al-kalām*. Edited by Sayyid Ahmad Husayni. Qom: Mu‘assasa al-Nashr al-Islami.
- ‘Alam al-Hudā, al-Sayyid al-Murtaḍā. 2002. *Al-Mulakkhāṣ fī uṣūl al-dīn*. Tehran: Markaz Nashr Danishgahi.
- Amīn, al-Sayyid Muḥsin al-. 1982. *A’yān al-Shī‘a*. Edited by Hassan Amin. Beirut: Dar al-Ta‘aruf.
- Āqā Buzurg Ṭīhrānī, Muḥammad Muḥsin. 1983. *Al-Dharī‘a ilā taṣānīf al-Shī‘a*. Beirut: Dar al-Adwā.
- Ardalan Javan, Seyyed Ali, ed. 1986. *Fihrist kutub khaṭīr kitābkhāna markazī Astan Quds Razavi*. Mashhad: Central Library of Astan Quds Razavi.
- Davani, Ali. 1985. *Mafākhīr Islām*. Tehran: Amir Kabir.
- Eqbal Ashtiani, Abbas. 1986. *Tārīkh Mughul*. Tehran: Amir Kabir.
- Fāḍil al-Miqdād, Jamāl al-Dīn b. ‘Abdullāh. 1984. *Irshād al-ṭālibīn ilā nahj al-mustarshidīn*. Edited by Sayyid Mahdi Rajaei. Qom: Matba‘a Sayyid al-Shuhadā and Maktaba Ayatollah Mar‘ashi Najafi.
- Fāḍil al-Miqdād, Jamāl al-Dīn b. ‘Abdullāh. 1991. *Al-I’timād fī sharḥ wājib al-i’tiqād*. Edited by Safā al-Din al-Basri. Mashhad: Islamic Research Foundation of Astane Quds Razavi.
- Fāḍil al-Miqdād, Jamāl al-Dīn b. ‘Abdullāh. 2001. *Al-Lawāmi‘ al-ilāhiyya fī l-mabāḥith al-kalāmiyya*. Edited by Qāḍī Ṭabāṭabā‘ī. Qom: Islamic Propagation Office.
- Ḥillī, al-Ḥasan b. Yūsuf al-. 1958. *Īdāḥ al-maqāṣid min ḥikma ‘ayn al-qawā‘id*. Edited by Ali Naqī Monzavi and Mohammad Meshkat. Tehran: University of Tehran Press.
- Ḥillī, al-Ḥasan b. Yūsuf al-. 1984. *Anwār al-malakūt fī sharḥ al-yāqūt*. Edited by Mohammad Najmi Zanjani. Qom: al-Sharif al-Radi.
- Ḥillī, al-Ḥasan b. Yūsuf al-. 1986. *Nahj al-ḥaqq wa-kashf al-ṣidq*. Prefaced by Seyyed Reza Sadr and annotated by Ayndullah Hassani Ormavi. Qom: Mu‘assasa Dar al-Hijra.
- Ḥillī, al-Ḥasan b. Yūsuf al-. 1988. *Al-Alfayn al-fāriq bayn al-ṣidq wa-l-mayn*. Qom: Hejrat.
- Ḥillī, al-Ḥasan b. Yūsuf al-. 1990. *Kashf al-yaqīn fī faḍā‘il Amīr al-Mu‘minīn*. Edited by Hossein Dargahi. Tehran: Publication Institute of the Ministry of Culture and Islamic Guidance.
- Ḥillī, al-Ḥasan b. Yūsuf al-. 1992a. *Al-Risālat al-Sa‘diyya*. Edited by Sayyed Mahmud Marashi and ‘Abd al-Husayn Muhammad ‘Ali Baqqal. Beirut: Dar al-Safwa.

- Hillī, al-Ḥasan b. Yūsuf al-. 1992b. *Qawā'id al-aḥkām fī ma'rifat al-aḥkām*. Edited by Mohammad Amin Ghafouri. Qom: Mu'assasa al-Nashr al-Islami.
- Hillī, al-Ḥasan b. Yūsuf al-. 1993. *Kashf al-murād fī sharḥ tajrīd al-i'tiqād*. Edited by Hassan Hassanzadeh Amoli. Qom: Mu'assasa al-Nashr al-Islami.
- Hillī, al-Ḥasan b. Yūsuf al-. 1994a. *Īdāḥ al-ishtibāḥ fī dābṭ tarājīm al-rijāl*. Edited by Muhammad al-Hassun. Qom: Society of Seminary Teachers of Qom.
- Hillī, al-Ḥasan b. Yūsuf al-. 1994b. *Manāḥij al-yaqīn fī uṣūl al-dīn*. Tehran: Dar al-Uswa.
- Hillī, al-Ḥasan b. Yūsuf al-. 1997. *Istiḡṣā' al-naẓar fī l-qaḏā' wa-l-qadar*. Edited by Sayyid Muhammad Husayni. Mashhad: Dar al-Anbā al-Ghayb.
- Hillī, al-Ḥasan b. Yūsuf al-. 1998. *Nahāyat al-marām fī 'ilm al-kalām*. Edited by Jafar Sobhani and Fadil al-Irfan. Qom: Imam Sadiq Institute.
- Hillī, al-Ḥasan b. Yūsuf al-. 2000. *Minhāj al-kirāma fī ma'rifat al-imāma*. Mashhad: Ashura Institute.
- Hillī, al-Ḥasan b. Yūsuf al-. 2001. *Khulāṣat al-aqwāl fī ma'rifat al-rijāl*. Edited by Javad Qayyumi. Qom: Mu'assasa Nashr al-Fiqaha.
- Hillī, al-Ḥasan b. Yūsuf al-. 2003. *Kashf al-murād fī sharḥ tajrīd al-i'tiqād*. Edited by Jafar Sobhani. Qom: Imam Sadiq Institute.
- Hillī, al-Ḥasan b. Yūsuf al-. 2005. *Taslīk al-naḥs ilā ḥaẓīrat al-quḏs*. Edited by Fatemeh Ramazani and prefaced by Jafar Sobhani. Qom: Imam Sadiq Institute.
- Hillī, al-Ḥasan b. Yūsuf al-. 2008. *Īdāḥ mukhālaḑa ahl al-sunna li-naṣṣ al-kitāb wa-l-sunna*. Edited by Bibi Sadat Razi Behabadi. Qom: Dalil-e Ma.
- Hillī, al-Ḥasan b. Yūsuf al-. 2009. *Ma'ārij al-fahm fī sharḥ al-naẓm*. Edited by Abdolali Sahebi, Aynollah Yadollahi, Mohammad Zarei Afīn, and Mohammad Ghaemi. Mashhad: Astan Quds Razavi.
- Hillī, al-Ḥasan b. Yūsuf al-. n.d. *Nahj al-mustarshidīn fī uṣūl al-dīn*. Edited by Sayyid Ahmad Husayni and Shaykh Hadi Yusufi. N.p.
- Himmaṣī, Sadīd al-Dīn. 1991. *Al-Munqīdh min al-taqlīd wa-l-murshīd ilā al-tawḥīd*. Qom: Mu'assasa al-Nashr al-Islami.
- Kāshānī, Abū l-Qāsim 'Abdullāh b. Muḥammad al-. 2005. *Tārīkh Ūljaitū*. Edited by Mahin Hambali. Tehran: Elmi Farhangi.
- Majlisī, Muḥammad Bāqir al-. 1983. *Biḥār al-anwār*. Beirut: Mu'assasa al-Wafā.
- Milani, Ali Hosseini. 1997. *Sharḥ minhāj al-kirāma fī ma'rifat al-imāma (al-nāfi 'yawm al-qiyāma)*. Qom: Mu'assasa Dar al-Hijra.
- Mufīd, Muḥammad b. Nu'mān al-. 1992a. *Al-Nukat al-i'tiqādiyya*. Qom: Word Conference of Shaykh Mufīd.
- Mufīd, Muḥammad b. Nu'mān al-. 1992b. *Al-Nukat fī muqaddamāt al-uṣūl*. Qom: Word Conference of Shaykh Mufīd.
- Mufīd, Muḥammad b. Nu'mān al-. 1992c. *Awā'il al-maqālāt fī l-madhāhib wa-l-mukhtārāt*. Qom: Word Conference of Shaykh Mufīd.
- Mufīd, Muḥammad b. Nu'mān al-. 1992d. *Taṣḥīḥ i'tiqādāt al-Imāmiyya*. Qom: Word Conference of Shaykh Mufīd.
- Muḥaqqiq al-Hillī, Najm al-Dīn al-. 1993. *Al-Maslak fī uṣūl al-dīn wa-l-risālat al-māti 'iyya*. Mashhad: Majma' al-Buḥūth al-Islāmiyya.

- Mūsawī Khwānsārī Iṣfahānī, Muḥammad Bāqir. 1990. *Rawḍāt al-jannāt fī aḥwāl al-‘ulamā’ wa-l-sādāt*. Beirut: al-Dar al-Islamiyya.
- Muzaffar, Muḥammad Ḥasan. 1995. *Dalā’il al-ṣidq*. Translated by Mohammad Sepehri. Tehran: Amir Kabir.
- Ṣadūq, Muḥammad b. Bābawayh, al-. 1977. *Al-Tawḥīd*. Qom: Mu’assasa al-Nashr al-Islami.
- Schmidtke, Sabine. 1999. *Andīsha-hāyi kalāmī ‘Allāma Ḥillī* (The Theology of al-‘Allāma al-Ḥillī). Translated by Ahmad Namayī. Mashhad: Islamic Research Foundation of Astane Quds Razavi.
- Shaykh al-Ṭūsī, Muḥammad al-. 1985. *Al-Iqtīṣād fīmā yata‘allaq bi-l-i’tiqād*. Beirut: Dar al-Adwā.
- Shaykh al-Ṭūsī, Muḥammad al-. 1990. *Al-‘Aqā’id al-Ja’ariyya*. Edited by Ebrahim Bahadori. Qom: Maktaba al-Nashr al-Islami.
- Shūshṭarī (Tustarī), Sayyid Nūrullāh. 1997. *Iḥqāq al-ḥaqq wa-izhāq al-bāṭil*. Annotated by Shahab al-Din Mar‘ashi Najafī and edited by Hassan Ghaffari. Tehran: Matba‘a al-Islamiyya.